

This is an Accepted Manuscript for *Infection Control & Hospital Epidemiology* as part of the Cambridge Coronavirus Collection.

DOI: 10.1017/ice.2021.318

Article Type: Letter to the Editor

Airborne transmission of SARS-CoV-2: what is the implication of hospital infection control?

Shuk-Ching Wong,¹ Lithia Lai-Ha Yuen,¹ Veronica Wing-Man Chan,¹ Jonathan Hon-Kwan Chen,³ Kelvin Kai-Wang To,³ Kwok-Yung Yuen,³ Vincent Chi-Chung Cheng^{1,2}

¹Infection Control Team, Queen Mary Hospital, Hong Kong West Cluster, Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, China

²Department of Microbiology, Queen Mary Hospital, Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, China

³Department of Microbiology, Li Ka Shing Faculty of Medicine, The University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, China.

Correspondence:

Vincent Chi-Chung CHENG

Infection Control Officer, Queen Mary Hospital, Hong Kong

Chief of Service & Consultant, Department of Microbiology, Queen Mary Hospital

Honorary Professor, Department of Microbiology, The University of Hong Kong

Word count: 900

To the Editor – Airborne transmission of severe acute respiratory syndrome associated coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2), the causative agent of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19), has been increasingly recognized in the indoor air environment,¹ especially in the poorly ventilated premises.² In the recent update of scientific brief by Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, the modes of SARS-CoV-2 transmission includes inhalation of very fine respiratory droplets and aerosol particles, in addition to deposition of virus on exposed mucous membranes, and touching mucous membranes with soiled hands contaminated with virus.³ Nosocomial outbreak of COVID-19 was possibly attributed to airborne transmission in an old-fashioned general ward with low ceiling height, despite 6 air change per hour (ACH).⁴ To establish the role of airborne transmission of SARS-CoV-2 in the healthcare setting, it is important to demonstrate the presence of SARS-CoV-2 RNA and preferably viable virus in the air sample. However, it is a challenging experiment. In the previous reports of air sampling in the clinical areas, the findings were inconsistent.⁵ It is not unexpected because air samplers with different mechanisms of sample collection such as solid impactors, liquid impactors, filters, and other sampling methods, were used. In addition, the testing protocols were different in terms of the relative position between patients and air samplers, number of patient in the room or ward, volume of air collection per sample, and the ACH of the patient care areas. The patient factors included the severity of clinical symptoms, the presence of aerosol-generating procedure (AGP), viral load of clinical specimens, and with or without wearing surgical mask during sample collection. Nevertheless, detection of SARS-CoV-2 RNA in air in the healthcare setting is summarized in the Supplementary Table. Most of these studies did not mention the patients' viral load and the use of surgical mask during sample collection.

To demonstrate the SARS-CoV-2 RNA viral load correlation between air and clinical samples, we performed air sampling in the airborne infection isolation room (AIIR) (16 square meters and 12 ACH), singly cared for an asymptomatic COVID-19 patient, who was an imported case with SARS-CoV-2 PANGO lineage B.1.525 from June 11, to June 17, 2021. No AGP was performed during air sample collection. We collected the air sample using a recently launched AerosolSense Sampler (Thermo Fisher Scientific, MA),⁶ which is ~14 inches in three dimensions and 26 lbs in weight, and placed 1 meter adjacent to patient's head. A single-use sampling cartridge containing 1-inch collection substrates is installed into the sampler. The air sample is

collected through an omnidirectional inlet and directed toward the collection substrate through an accelerating slit impactor at a flow rate of 200L per minute. Particles are trapped on the collection substrate as the air moves around the collection area. After the sampling cycle of 2, 4 and 8 hours in patient with or without wearing surgical mask, the sample cartridge is removed and sent to microbiology laboratory within 30 minutes. The collection substrate is then immersed into 1.5 ml viral transport medium, and 250 µl of medium were used for total nucleic acid extraction using the eMAG extraction system (bioMérieux, Marcy-l'Etoile, France) following manufacturer's instruction. Quantifications of SARS-CoV-2 RNA in the air samples were performed by the ultra-sensitive reverse-transcriptase droplet digital polymerase chain reaction (RT-ddPCR) using the QX200 Droplet Digital PCR System (Bio-Rad Life Science, CA, USA) as previously described.⁷ The nasopharyngeal swabs were subjected to the same laboratory processing protocol. The viral loads of the air and clinical samples were summarized in Table 1.

Our finding has implication in hospital infection control. In contrast to our previous report of undetectable SARS-CoV-2 RNA in collecting 1,000L air,⁸ the SARS-CoV-2 RNA was detected at a concentration of 0.009 copies/L in a COVID-19 patient, without wearing surgical mask, with moderate level of viral load (6,828,801 copies/ml) in nasopharyngeal swab when 96,000 L air was collected in 8 hours. SARS-CoV-2 RNA was also detected (0.005 copies/L) in another 8-hour air sample despite wearing surgical mask. It appears that a low quantity of SARS-CoV-2 RNA can be detected in air even in the AIIR with 12 ACH, when a large volume of air is collected for a prolonged period. If the experiment is performed in a general ward with 6 ACH, a higher quantity of SARS-CoV-2 RNA may be detected in air. Then, inhalation of SARS-CoV-2 by patient may be possible if there is an unrecognized COVID-19 case in the same cubicle.⁴ In that case, portable high-efficiency particulate filter may be installed, especially in the old-fashioned ward with suboptimal ventilation. In addition to the recommendation of wearing surgical respirator among healthcare workers (HCWs) during AGP, we also suggest universal masking of patient and HCWs workers to reduce the risk of nosocomial transmission SARS-CoV-2 in the healthcare setting,⁹ when the herd immunity of COVID-19 vaccination is not achieved.

Similar to the healthcare system in other developed areas, we manage COVID-19 patients in hospital AIIR with 12 ACH or community treatment facility (CTF) with air ventilation of

80L/s/person in Hong Kong.¹⁰ Full personal protective equipment including surgical respirator, cap, face shield, gown, and gloves is mandated when caring for COVID-19 patients. The risk of inhalation of SARS-CoV-2 by HCWs in the hospital AIIR or CTF is extremely low. However, transmission of SARS-CoV-2 is not only limited to airborne route. Infection control professional should update HCWs workers with new scientific evidence while enforcing hand hygiene, standard, contact, and droplets precautions to prevent nosocomial outbreak of COVID-19.

Acknowledgement

We thank our frontline staff of airborne infection isolation ward of Queen Mary Hospital to facilitate this study.

Financial support.

This study was supported by the Health and Medical Research Fund (HMRF) Commissioned Research on Control of Infectious Disease (Phase IV), CID-HKU1-16, Food and Health Bureau, Hong Kong SAR Government.

Conflict of interest.

All authors report no conflicts of interest relevant to this article.

Table 1. SARS-CoV-2 RNA viral load correlation between clinical and air samples in airborne infection isolation room singly cared for an asymptomatic COVID-19 patient^a

Sampling no. ^b	Wearing surgical mask during air sampling ^c	Duration / total volume of air collection ^d	VL of NPS (copies per ml) ^{e, f}	VL of air sample (copies per sample) ^f	VL of air sample (copies per L of air)
1	No	2 hours / 24,000 L	355,692	ND	-
2	Yes	2 hours / 24,000 L	355,692	ND	-
3	No	4 hours / 48,000 L	14,140	ND	-
4	Yes	4 hours / 48,000 L	14,140	ND	-
5	No	8 hours / 96,000 L	6,828,801	774	0.009
6	Yes	8 hours / 96,000 L	974	497	0.005

Note. ND, not detected; NPS, nasopharyngeal swab; SARS-CoV-2, severe acute respiratory syndrome associated coronavirus 2; VL, viral load.

^a No aerosol-generating procedure was performed during the air sample collection.

^b The air samples were collected in day time. To explore the presence of SARS-CoV-2 RNA in the air, the first sample (sample 5) was collected for 8 hours in the airborne infection isolation room where patient not wearing surgical mask. Subsequently, we collected air samples at 2-hour and 4-hour interval in the same patient with or without wearing surgical mask, and followed by the last air sample (sample 6, 8-hour with wearing surgical mask).

^c The COVID-19 patient wore American Society of Testing and Materials level 1 standard surgical masks during air sampling.

^d AerosolSense Sampler (Thermo Fisher Scientific Inc., MA) is used. The airflow rate is 200 L per minute.

^e The viral load of NPS collected on the same day of air sampling.

^f Specific primer/probe set targeting the SARS-CoV-2 N2 gene and the human housekeeping gene RNase P gene were assessed for use in RT-ddPCR. The cycling conditions were: 50°C (60 min), 95°C (10 min), 40 cycles of 94°C (30 sec) and 60°C (1 min), 98°C (10 min), 4°C (30 min), 4°C (∞). Data analysis was performed by using the QuantaSoft Analysis Pro Software (Bio-Rad Life Science, CA, USA).

References of the main text

1. Noorimotlagh Z, Jaafarzadeh N, Martínez SS, Mirzaee SA. A systematic review of possible airborne transmission of the COVID-19 virus (SARS-CoV-2) in the indoor air environment. *Environ Res* 2021;193:110612.
2. Li Y, Qian H, Hang J, *et al.* Probable airborne transmission of SARS-CoV-2 in a poorly ventilated restaurant. *Build Environ* 2021;196:107788.
3. Scientific Brief: SARS-CoV-2 transmission. Updates as of May 7, 2021. <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/science/science-briefs/sars-cov-2-transmission.html>. Accessed June 20, 2021.
4. Cheng VC, Fung KS, Siu GK, *et al.* Nosocomial outbreak of COVID-19 by possible airborne transmission leading to a superspreading event. *Clin Infect Dis* 2021 Apr 14:ciab313. doi: 10.1093/cid/ciab313.
5. Borges JT, Nakada LYK, Maniero MG, Guimarães JR. SARS-CoV-2: a systematic review of indoor air sampling for virus detection. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int* 2021 Feb 25:1–14. doi: 10.1007/s11356-021-13001-w.
6. Thermo Fisher Scientific Launches In-Air SARS-CoV-2 Surveillance Solution. <https://thermofisher.mediaroom.com/2021-03-24-Thermo-Fisher-Scientific-Launches-In-Air-SARS-CoV-2-Surveillance-Solution>. Accessed June 20, 2021.
7. Wong SC, Yuen LL, Chen JH, Yuen KY, Cheng VC. Infection control challenges in handling recurrent blockage of sewage pipes in isolation facility designated for patients with COVID-19. *J Hosp Infect* 2021 Mar 7:S0195-6701(21)00086-4. doi: 10.1016/j.jhin.2021.03.002.
8. Cheng VC, Wong SC, Chan VW, *et al.* Air and environmental sampling for SARS-CoV-2 around hospitalized patients with coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19). *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol* 2020;41:1258-1265.
9. Wong SC, Lam GK, AuYeung CH, *et al.* Absence of nosocomial influenza and respiratory syncytial virus infection in the coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) era: Implication of universal masking in hospitals. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol* 2021;42:218-221.
10. Wong SC, Leung M, Tong DW, *et al.* Infection control challenges in setting up community isolation and treatment facilities for patients with coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19): Implementation of directly observed environmental disinfection. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol* 2020 Dec 7:1-9. doi: 10.1017/ice.2020.1355.

Supplementary Table. Summary of peer-review publications in the detection of SARS-CoV-2 RNA in air in the patient areas of hospitals

Ref.	Country [publication]	Setting [ACH, if mentioned]	Air sampler, [duration / volume of air, if mentioned]	Detection of SARS-CoV-2 RNA in air [Ct of VL in air, if mentioned]	Patient viral load (Ct or VL)	Mask for patients
1	Singapore [May 2020]	AIIR [ACH: 12]	NIOSH aerosol sampler; [4 h / 5040 L]	2 of 3 (66.7%) AIIR; [916 to 2000 copies /m ³]	Ct: 18.45 to 20.11	NM
2	China [Jun 2020]	Patient areas in two hospitals ^a	Presterilized gelatin filters with pore size 3 μm	63.6% (7/11) samples; [1 to 113 copies /m ³]	NM	NM
3	US [Jun 2020]	A clinic	Laminar-flow water vapor condensation; [1 h / 390 L]	50% (1/2) samples; [0.87 copies / L]	NM	NM
4	China [Jul 2020]	ICU [ACH: 12] & GW [ACH: 8]	SASS 2300 wetted wall cyclone sampler; [30 min / 9000 L]	35% (14/40) of ICU samples and 12.5% (2/16) of GW samples	NM	Yes
5	US [Jul 2020]	AIIR [ACH: >12]	Sartorius airport MD8 air sampler; [15 min / 750 L]	80.0% (32/40) samples; [average: 2.99 copies/L of air] ^b	NM	NM
6	UK [Jul 2020]	Patient cares in hospital	Coriolis μ air sampler; {NM}	12.5% (2/16) samples; [404 to 7048 copies /m ³]	NM	NM
7	China [Oct 2020]	ICU & isolation ward	Air sampler not specified; [1 h / 300 L]	8.3% (1/12) samples ^c	NM	Yes
8	Italy	ICU	MD8 airport portable air	100% (20/20) samples in patient	NM	NM

	[Nov 2020]		sampler; [40 min / 2000 L]	corridor & contaminated zone		
9	China [Nov 2020]	ICU & isolation ward	Two-stage cyclonic bioaerosol sampler; [4 h / 840 L]	1 sample in ICU [Ct: 41.5] & 3 samples in isolation ward [Ct: 35.6 to 44.6]	VL: 1.7 to 7x10 ⁷ copies/ml	Yes
10	Iran [Dec 2020]	ICU & other clinical areas	Liquid impinge biosampler; [NM]	14.3% (2/14) samples ^d	NM	NM
11	Singapore [Jan 2021]	AIIR [ACH: 12]	BioSpot-VIVAS BSS300-P bioaerosol sampler; [NM]	50% (6/12) samples; [Ct: 32.62 to 38.36] ^e	Ct: 15.22 to 20.53	NM
12	US [Feb 2021]	ICU & medical ward [ACH: >6]	Sartorius MD8 airscan sampler; [20-40 min / 1000-4000 L]	14.2% (2/14) samples; [Ct: 33.04 to 36.27]	NM	NM
13	India [Apr 2021]	ICU, medical & emergency ward	Total suspended particulate air sampler; [1 h / 90 L to 1620 L]	60% (54/90) samples; [Ct 16.11 to 32.5] ^f	NM	NM

Note. ACH, air change per hour; AIIR, airborne infection isolation room; Ct, cycle threshold value; GW, general ward; ICU, intensive care unit; NM, not mentioned; VL, viral load.

^a Renmin Hospital and Fangcang Hospital in Wuhan, China.

^b Analysis of data from the supplementary information.

^c The positive air sample was collected within 10 cm of a patient who was undergoing endotracheal intubation for mechanical ventilation.

^d Two positive air samples were collected in ICU.

^e Virus culture from air samples was negative.

^f Air samples collected from nursing station area separated from the patients by glass wall were excluded for analysis.

References of supplementary table

1. Chia PY, Coleman KK, Tan YK, Ong SWX, Gum M, Lau SK, Lim XF, Lim AS, Sutjipto S, Lee PH, Son TT, Young BE, Milton DK, Gray GC, Schuster S, Barkham T, De PP, Vasoo S, Chan M, Ang BSP, Tan BH, Leo YS, Ng OT, Wong MSY, Marimuthu K; Singapore 2019 Novel Coronavirus Outbreak Research Team. Detection of air and surface contamination by SARS-CoV-2 in hospital rooms of infected patients. *Nat Commun.* 2020 May 29;11(1):2800.
2. Liu Y, Ning Z, Chen Y, Guo M, Liu Y, Gali NK, Sun L, Duan Y, Cai J, Westerdahl D, Liu X, Xu K, Ho KF, Kan H, Fu Q, Lan K. Aerodynamic analysis of SARS-CoV-2 in two Wuhan hospitals. *Nature.* 2020 Jun;582(7813):557-560.
3. Lednicky JA, Shankar SN, Elbadry MA, Gibson JC, Alam MM, Stephenson CJ, Eiguren-Fernandez A, Morris JG, Mavian CN, Salemi M, Clugston JR, Wu CY. Collection of SARS-CoV-2 Virus from the Air of a Clinic Within a University Student Health Care Center and Analyses of the Viral Genomic Sequence. *Aerosol Air Qual Res.* 2020 Jun;20(6):1167-1171.
4. Guo ZD, Wang ZY, Zhang SF, Li X, Li L, Li C, Cui Y, Fu RB, Dong YZ, Chi XY, Zhang MY, Liu K, Cao C, Liu B, Zhang K, Gao YW, Lu B, Chen W. Aerosol and Surface Distribution of Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2 in Hospital Wards, Wuhan, China, 2020. *Emerg Infect Dis.* 2020 Jul;26(7):1583-1591.
5. Santarpia JL, Rivera DN, Herrera VL, Morwitzer MJ, Creager HM, Santarpia GW, Crown KK, Brett-Major DM, Schnaubelt ER, Broadhurst MJ, Lawler JV, Reid SP, Lowe JJ. Aerosol and surface contamination of SARS-CoV-2 observed in quarantine and isolation care. *Sci Rep.* 2020 Jul 29;10(1):12732.
6. Zhou J, Otter JA, Price JR, Cimpeanu C, Garcia DM, Kinross J, Boshier PR, Mason S, Bolt F, Holmes AH, Barclay WS. Investigating SARS-CoV-2 surface and air contamination in an acute healthcare setting during the peak of the COVID-19 pandemic in London. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2020 Jul 8:ciaa905. doi: 10.1093/cid/ciaa905.

7. Tan L, Ma B, Lai X, Han L, Cao P, Zhang J, Fu J, Zhou Q, Wei S, Wang Z, Peng W, Yang L, Zhang X. Air and surface contamination by SARS-CoV-2 virus in a tertiary hospital in Wuhan, China. *Int J Infect Dis*. 2020 Oct;99:3-7.
8. Razzini K, Castrica M, Menchetti L, Maggi L, Negroni L, Orfeo NV, Pizzoccheri A, Stocco M, Muttini S, Balzaretta CM. SARS-CoV-2 RNA detection in the air and on surfaces in the COVID-19 ward of a hospital in Milan, Italy. *Sci Total Environ*. 2020 Nov 10;742:140540.
9. Lei H, Ye F, Liu X, Huang Z, Ling S, Jiang Z, Cheng J, Huang X, Wu Q, Wu S, Xie Y, Xiao C, Ye D, Yang Z, Li Y, Leung NHL, Cowling BJ, He J, Wong SS, Zanin M. SARS-CoV-2 environmental contamination associated with persistently infected COVID-19 patients. *Influenza Other Respir Viruses*. 2020 Nov;14(6):688-699. doi: 10.1111/irv.12783.
10. Kenarkoohi A, Noorimotlagh Z, Falahi S, Amarloei A, Mirzaee SA, Pakzad I, Bastani E. Hospital indoor air quality monitoring for the detection of SARS-CoV-2 (COVID-19) virus. *Sci Total Environ*. 2020 Dec 15;748:141324.
11. Ong SWX, Tan YK, Coleman KK, Tan BH, Leo YS, Wang DL, Ng CG, Ng OT, Wong MSY, Marimuthu K. Lack of viable severe acute respiratory coronavirus virus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) among PCR-positive air samples from hospital rooms and community isolation facilities. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol*. 2021 Jan 25:1-6. doi: 10.1017/ice.2021.8.
12. Munoz-Price LS, Rivera F, Ledebner N. Air contamination of households versus hospital inpatient rooms occupied by severe acute respiratory coronavirus virus 2 (SARS-CoV-2)-positive patients. *Infect Control Hosp Epidemiol*. 2021 Feb 4:1-5. doi: 10.1017/ice.2021.45.
13. Dubey A, Kotnala G, Mandal TK, Sonkar SC, Singh VK, Guru SA, Bansal A, Irungbam M, Husain F, Goswami B, Kotnala RK, Saxena S, Sharma SK, Saxena KN, Sharma C, Kumar S, Aswal DK, Manchanda V, Koner BC. Evidence of the presence of SARS-CoV-2 virus in atmospheric air and surfaces of a dedicated COVID hospital. *J Med Virol*. 2021 Apr 29. doi: 10.1002/jmv.27029.